# HEAVY MOVABLE STRUCTURES, INC. FOURTEENTH BIENNIAL SYMPOSIUM

October 22 – 25, 2012

# Value Engineering and Cost Saving Innovations: CSX Mobile River Lift Bridge Eric Kelly, William Nickoley, and Joseph Wasielewski HNTB Corporation

CARIBE ROYALE HOTEL ORLANDO, FLORIDA

### VALUE ENGINEERING AND COST SAVING INNOVATIONS: CSX MOBILE RIVER BRIDGE

### Abstract

After bids came in 73% higher than the Engineer's Estimate, the U.S. Coast Guard selected HNTB to perform a Value Engineering Review of a movable rail bridge over the Mobile River in Alabama. HNTB used their extensive experience on movable bridges to examine the foundations, superstructure, constructability as well as the mechanical and electrical systems to develop cost savings throughout structure.

This paper will discuss the original structure configuration, Contractor's input regarding the erection, staging, closures to rail and marine traffic associated with the original design, and main details of the redesign which resulted in cost savings.

The paper will discuss the cost effective redesign performed by HNTB to lower the estimated construction cost of the bridge without sacrificing any of the design requirements.

Topics discussed in the paper will be as follows:

- High cost details of original bridge
- Cost effective alternatives
- Details of alternate design
- Cost comparison of the two alternate structures

# **Project Background**

### **Existing Bridge (See Figure 1)**

The existing structure is a single track, 330 foot (2 @ 165 feet) center bearing swing span that provides one clear channel of 146'-7" over the Mobile River. To the east of the swing span, the structure has 800 feet of timber approach trestle and one 208 foot variable depth truss span. To the west there are two 208 foot variable depth truss spans and an 80 foot long through girder span. The superstructure is supported on un-reinforced concrete piers with soil bearing footings. Due to river geometry, the structure has been hit numerous times causing interruptions in rail and navigation traffic, along with an extensive amount of repairs. Pier 4 had previously been struck shearing the pier horizontally and requiring extensive repairs. The navigational clearance was determined to be inadequate by the United States Coast Guard and thus the agency requested CSX, the owner, to replace the movable span to provide more navigation clearance, funded under the Truman Hobbs Act (CFR 33, 2008).



Figure 1. Elevation of Existing Bridge

### **Original Design for Replacement Structure (See Figure 2)**

The criteria for the replacement structure was to provide a 56 foot 5 inch vertical clearance over a 300 foot wide channel. A 365 foot through-truss, span-drive vertical lift bridge was determined to be the optimum solution by another consultant. The design incorporated a new pier behind Pier 4 and the

existing Pier 2 was strengthened for the new lift span. Drilled shafts were used for the foundation of the new Pier 4A and strengthened Pier 2. The towers for the lift span were each to be four leg trussed steel elements. The rear tower legs would be supported on their own new separate piers. All piers were to be constructed utilizing cofferdams. A 42 foot tower span would be placed within each tower to span between the front and rear tower legs. To accommodate the towers for the lift span, the two fixed truss spans on either side of the swing span required modification to shorten their overall length. Existing Pier 4 with a recently replaced fender system was to remain and be utilized for pier protection. A new fender system was to be installed at Pier 2.



Figure 2. General Plan and Elevation of Proposed Replacement Structure (CSX Plans, 2006)

# **Bids and Resulting Efforts**

### **Bid tabulations**

The project was advertised on February 24, 2006. Questions were raised during bidding including a letter from one of the prospective bidders indicating certain requirements in the contract specifications made the cost of the project higher than anticipated. Three bids were received on May 4, 2006 with the low bid at \$30 million above the Engineer's Estimate. (See Figure 3) Since the variation was too great to award, the bids were rejected. The Coast Guard then contacted three consultants to solicit bids to perform a Value Engineering of the project in an effort to find cost saving suggestions. HNTB Corporation was selected for the assignment.

PROJECT: Replace Exsting Swing Span with Vertical Lft Span liter No.         PROJECT: Replace Exsting Swing Span with Vertical Lft Span extent of the method of the method set of the method state of the method set of the method set of the method of the method set of the method set of the method set of the method of the method set of the me	a a	Amount 00000 00 50000 00 50000 00 50000 00 50000 00 5000 00 5000 00 5000 00 5000 00 5000 00 5000 00 5000 00 5000 00 0000 00 5000 00 0000 00 5000 00 0000 00 000000		Co Unit Price \$50,000,000 00 \$50,000 00 \$50,000 00 \$1,2320 00 \$1,2320 00 \$1,2320 00 \$1,2320 00 \$1,2420 00 \$1,150 00 \$1,150 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 000 \$1,200 000 \$1,200 000 \$1,200 \$1,200 000 \$1,200 000 \$1,200 \$	Contractor 3 Total Amount Total Amount se, 000 000 00 se, 000 000 00 se, 000 000 00 se, 000 00 se, 1, 200 00 se, 2, 2, 2, 2, 00 se, 2, 2, 2, 00 se, 2, 2, 2, 00 se, 2, 2, 2, 00 se, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2,
Bid Quantities         Estra Oly         Unit Price           Mobilization         Estra Oly         Unit Price         Estra Oly           Mobilization         Estra Oly         Unit Price         Estra Oly           Partnering         1         Ls.         \$1,820,000           Partnering         1         Ls.         \$1,920,000           Partnering         1         Ls.         \$1,920,000           Partnering         1         Ls.         \$1,920,000           Diriled Shaft 7: Casing         1,322         LF.         \$1,43           Diriled Shaft 7: Casing         1,322         LF.         \$1,43           Protection of Existing Structures         1,322         \$1,520,000         \$1,520,000           Structural Excavation         1,322         LF.         \$1,43         \$1,520,000           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         1,328         LF.         \$1,43         \$1,520,000           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         2,500,000         LB         \$1,20         \$1,000           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         2,500,000         LF.         \$1,40         \$2,52           Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc.)         2,500,000         CY.         \$2,52           Structural Steel (Lift S	Contra	Amount 600000 50000 50000 50000 50000 50000 500000 500000 500000 500000 60000 60000 600000 600000 600000 6000000 6000000 6000000 6000000 6000000 6000000 6000000 60000000 60000000 600000000	ontra	Co Unit Price \$55,000 00 \$55,000 00 \$51,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,350 00 \$1,350 00 \$1,350 00 \$1,350 00 \$1,400 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,500 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,100 000 00 \$1,100 000000000000000000000000000000000	Total Amount Total Amount 550,000 00 550,000 00 550,000 00 550,000 00 550,000 00 550,000 00 515,240,00 515,440,00 515,440,00 515,440,00 515,440,00 515,240,000 00 515,240,000 00 515,240,000 00 515,240,000 00 515,240,000 00 51,240,000 00 51,240,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,250,000 00 51,257,000 00 51,2
Ibid liet molectrybon         Ext d Oy.         Unit Price           Mobilization         1         Ls.         \$1,625,000           Partnommental Protection         1         Ls.         \$1,625,000           Partnommental Protection         1         Ls.         \$1,965           Drilled Shaft (7 clas)         2,355         LF.         \$1,45           Drilled Shaft (7 clas)         1,366         C.Y.         \$1,366           Drilled Shaft (7 casing Exploratory Borngs         4,45         Casing 4,45         \$1,45           Drinled Shaft (7 casing Exploratory Borngs         4,46         C.Y.         \$2,49           Structural Excavation         0,700         C.Y.         \$4,90         \$1,700           Concrete Class A (AE) (Slubstructure)         4         C.Y.         \$5,400         \$2,50           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         2,200,000         LB         \$2,50         \$2,50           Structural Steel (Counte		Amount 0,000 00 1,000 00 1,000 00 1,000 00 1,2,840 00 1,2,840 00 1,450 00 4,560 00 4,560 00 4,560 00 1,160 00 1,160 00 1,160 00 0,000 00 8,000 00 0,000 00 0,00		Unit Price \$56,000.000 00 \$56,000.000 00 \$5,320.000 00 \$1,240.000 00 \$1,240.000 00 \$1,240.000 00 \$1,240.000 00 \$1,350.000 00 \$1,100.000 00 \$1,100.000 00 \$1,100.000 00 \$1,000 000 00 \$2,000 000 000 00 \$2,000 000 000 00 \$2,000 000 000 00 \$2,000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 00	Total Amount \$5,000,000 00 \$55,000 00 \$55,000 00 \$4,528,640 00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,00 \$1,640,000 \$1,640,000 \$1,640,000 \$1,640,000 \$1,540,000 \$1,540,000 \$1,547,000 00 \$1,557,000 00 \$5,500 00 \$5,5000 00 \$5,5000 00 \$5,5000 00 \$5,5000 00 \$5,
Mobilization         1         LS         \$1,229,000           Partnering         1         LS         \$1,000           Partnering         1         LS         \$1,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,152         \$1,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,352         LF         \$1,45           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,352         LF         \$1,45           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,352         LF         \$1,45           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,355         LF         \$1,45           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,356         LF         \$1,45           Structural Excavation         Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)         \$1,000         \$1,25           Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)         2,000         CY         \$2,40           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         2,500         CY         \$2,52           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         2,500         CY         \$2,52           Structural Steel (Lift Span)				Unit Price 59,000,000 00 556,000 00 556,000 00 51,2420 00 51,2420 00 51,2420 00 51,2400 00 51,2400 00 51,2400 00 51,2400 00 51,2400 00 51,040 00 51,000	Total Amount \$9,000,000 0 \$56,000 00 \$55,000 00 \$46,720 00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$15,920,000 00 \$15,920,000 00 \$15,920,000 00 \$15,920,000 00 \$17,4,000 00 \$17,340,000 00 \$17,340,000 00 \$1,320,000 00 \$1,520,000 00 \$1,550,000 00 \$1,5
Mobilization         1         LS         \$1,829,000           Partnering         Environmental Protection         1         LS         \$1,829,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1,900           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1,000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1,40           Structural Excavation         Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)         4,40         C         \$1,700           Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)         Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)         5         C         \$1,700           Structural Steel (Towers Misc)         Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)         5         C         \$1,40           Structural Steel (Towers Misc)         Structures         1         LS         \$1,20           Structural Steel (Towers Misc)         Structures         Structur				\$59,000,000 00 \$56,000 00 \$50,000 00 \$2,1240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,000 00 \$1,000 00 \$3,000 0	\$5,000,000,00 \$55,000,00 \$4,528,000,00 \$4,528,640,00 \$18,45,200,00 \$19,52,000,00 \$19,52,000,00 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$15,520,000 \$1,557,000,000,00 \$1,557,000,000 \$1,557,000,000\$1,557,000,000 \$1,557,000,0000 \$1,557,000,0000 \$1,557,000000 \$1,557,0000000 \$1,557,0000000 \$1,557,0000000000000000000000000000000000
Partnering         1         LS         \$500           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$1000           Drilled Shaft (7 dia)         1,325         LF         \$143           Exploratory Borings         1,325         LF         \$143           Protection of Existing Structures         1,325         LF         \$143           Structural Excavation         6,700         C         \$1,325         \$1,43           Structural Excavation         6,700         C         \$1,325         \$1,40           Structural Excavation         6,700         C         \$1,326         \$1,700           Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)         5         C         \$1,700         \$1,20           Structural Steel (Liff Span Misc)         2,600         C         \$1,40         \$2,32           Structural Steel (Liff Span Misc)         2,600         C         \$1,40           Structural Steel (Countervelopidid)         2,600         C         \$1,40           Structural Steel (Countervelopidid)         2,600         C         \$1,40           Stru				\$56,000 00 \$50,000 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,240 00 \$7705 00 \$7705 00 \$7705 00 \$7705 00 \$7705 00 \$7705 00 \$7705 00 \$1,240 00 \$1,040 00 \$1,000 00 \$	\$56,000.00 \$4,52,8,40.00 \$1,445,720.00 \$1,445,720.00 \$1,445,720.00 \$1,544,00 \$1,5,800.00 \$15,800.00 \$15,920.000 \$15,920.000 \$15,920.000 \$15,920.000 \$17,000.00 \$15,220,000.00 \$17,4,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$5,550,0000
Environmentral Protection     1     L.S.     \$10,000       Drilled Shaft (7 dia)     1,325     L.F.     \$1,325       Drilled Shaft (7 dia)     Load Test     1,325     L.F.     \$1,326       Structural Excavation     6,700     C.Y.     \$48     \$1,25       Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     4,400     L.B.     \$1,326       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     C.Y.     \$4960     \$1,20       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     C.Y.     \$48     \$1,20       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,200,000     C.Y.     \$24,000     \$1,20       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,200,000     C.Y.     \$22,55       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,700,000     LB     \$1,156       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,700,000     LB     \$1,156       Structural Steel (Luing Trustwork)     5     \$24,000     LF     \$1,320       Structu		v v ti ti		\$50,000.00 \$1,540.00 \$1,600.00 \$1,600.00 \$1,600.00 \$1,350.00 \$1,35.000.00 \$1,35.000.00 \$1,35.000.00 \$1,35.000.00 \$1,400.00 \$1,100.00 \$1,000.00 \$1,000.00 \$3,980.00 \$3,980.00 \$3,040.00 \$3,000.00 \$3,000.00 \$3,000.00 \$3,000.0000 \$3,000.0000 \$3,000.000 \$3,000.000 \$3,000.000 \$3,000.000 \$3,000.000 \$3,000.0000\$3,000000 \$3,0000000\$3,000000\$3,0000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,0000000\$3,0000000\$3,000000\$3,0000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,00000\$3,00000\$3,00000\$3,0000000\$3,00000\$3,00000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,000000\$3,00000\$3,00000\$3,00	\$50,000 00 \$1,528,640 00 \$1,528,640 00 \$19,528,640 00 \$19,12,000 \$1315,840,00 \$135,940,00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$15,320,000 00 \$15,320,000 00 \$15,320,000 00 \$17,340,000 00 \$1,320,000 00 \$1,550,000 00 \$5,550,000 00 \$1,550,000 00 \$5,550,000
Drilled Shaft // Casing     1,952     L.F.     \$1,358     L.F.     \$1,358       Drilled Shaft // Casing     213     L.F.     \$1,358     L.F.     \$1,358       Drilled Shaft // Casing     213     L.F.     \$1,358     L.F.     \$1,358       Drilled Shaft // Casing     213     L.F.     \$1,358     L.F.     \$1,458       Drilled Shaft // Casing     213     L.F.     \$1,458     \$1,200       Drintorcing Steel     Arth (Shabstructures)     1     E.A.     \$500,500     \$4,88       Structural Steel     Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     C.Y.     \$500     \$500       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     C.Y.     \$500     \$1,700       Structural Steel (Liff Span)     2,200,000     L.F.     \$1,300       Structural Steel (Liff Span)     2,200,000     L.F.     \$1,300       Structural Steel (Liff Span)     2,200,000     L.F.     \$1,300       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     L.B.     \$2,300       Structural Steel (Liff Span)     2,200,000     L.F.     \$3,400       Structural Steel (Liff Span)     2,200,000     L.F.     \$3,120       Structural Steel (Liff Span)     2,200,000     L.F.     \$3,255       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000		\$1 \$1,0 1,5 2,1,5,		\$2,320.00 \$1,240.00 \$1,240.00 \$1705.00 \$135,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$1,400.00 \$1,040.00 \$1,040.00 \$32,000 \$31,040.00 \$31,040.00 \$31,040.00 \$31,040.00 \$31,040.00 \$33,040.00 \$34,040.00 \$35,040.000\$35,040.000\$35,040.000\$35,040.000\$35,040.000\$35,040.000\$35,00	\$4,528,640,00 \$1945,720,00 \$1945,720,00 \$1945,720,00 \$195,000,00 \$135,000,00 \$135,000,00 \$15,920,000,00 \$15,920,000,00 \$475,100,00 \$15,280,000,00 \$15,280,000,00 \$175,000,000 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,00 \$175,000,000 \$175,000,00 \$155,000,000 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,000 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,000 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,000 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,000 \$155,000,00 \$155,000,0000\$20,000,0000\$20,000,0000\$20,000,00
Drilled Shaft (> Casing Drilled Shaft (> Casing Explorationy Borngs         1,326         LF         \$740           Drilled Shaft (> Casing Explorationy Borngs         1,326         LF         \$148           Protection of Existing Structures         1         LS         \$100           Statnamic Axial Lead Test         1         LS         \$100           Contracted Cass A (AE) (Stubstructure)         4         EA         \$100           Concreted Cass A (AE) (Black)         5         C (Y \$450         \$490           Concrete Cass A (AE) (Black)         5         C (Y \$450         \$490           Concrete Cass A (AE) (Black)         5         C (Y \$450         \$400           Structural Steel (Lift Span)         2,200,000         C (Y \$525         \$500           Structural Steel (Lowers)         1,700,000         LB         \$2,225           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         5         \$5,000         \$2,500           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         2,5000         C (Y \$525         \$5,225		31,5 31,5	· · ·	\$1,240.00 \$1,600.00 \$1,600.00 \$2975.000.00 \$135.000.00 \$1,1000.00 \$1,1000.00 \$1,1040.00 \$1,060.00 \$1,060.00 \$1,000.000\$ \$1,000.000\$	\$1,846,720,00 \$591,200,00 \$3915,840,00 \$581,000,00 \$581,640,00 \$482,600,00 \$482,400,00 \$475,400,00 \$472,400,00 \$67,260,000 \$67,260,000 \$67,260,000 \$1,320,000,00 \$1,320,000,00 \$1,320,000,00 \$1,320,000,00 \$1,557,000,000,00 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,000 \$1,557,000,000 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,00 \$1,557,000,000,000 \$1,557,000,000 \$1,557,000,000 \$1,557,000,000,000 \$1,557,000,000\$}
Driffed Shaft Y casing Exploratory Borings     422     L.F.     \$168       Protection of Existing Structures Exploratory Borings     432     L.F.     \$143       Protection of Existing Structures Statument Axial Load Test, Confertances     1     L.S.     \$70,000       Structural Excavation     6,700     C,Y     \$40     \$12,00       Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     6,700     C,Y     \$40     \$12,00       Concrete Class A (AE) (Ninci)     6,700     C,Y     \$40     \$12,00       Concrete Class A (AE) (Ninci)     5     C,Y     \$43     \$12,00       Concrete Class A (AE) (Ninci)     5     C,Y     \$42     \$12,00       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     C,Y     \$42     \$12,00       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     C,Y     \$42     \$140       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     C,Y     \$43     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     1,700,000     LB     \$2,25     \$140       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,40,000     LB     \$2,25     \$140       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     1,700,000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     1,700,000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,40,00		\$1,0 \$1,5	·· ··	\$1,500.00 \$7705.00 \$7705.00 \$135,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$1,200.000 \$1,200.0000 \$1,200.0000 \$1,200.0000 \$1,200.000 \$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0000\$1,200.0	8881,200,00 \$55,000,00 \$55,000,00 \$975,000,00 \$155,200,000 \$155,200,000 \$15,220,000,00 \$15,220,000,00 \$15,220,000,00 \$17,240,000,00 \$1,327,000,00 \$1,327,000,00 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000\$1,577,000,000 \$1,577,000,000,000 \$1,577,000,000,000,000,000,000,000,000,000
Expinent of Existing Structures     48     LF     \$143       Expinent of Existing Structures     1     E.A     \$700     \$45       Statmanic Avial Load Test     1     E.A     \$70000     \$40     \$413       Structural Excavation     Conferedams     1     E.A     \$70000     \$40     \$40     \$413       Structural Excavation     Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     4     A     \$500,000     \$40     \$500,000       Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     5     \$500,000     \$40     \$500,000       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     C.Y.     \$400     \$50     \$70,000       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2.2,00000     C.Y.     \$554     \$200       Structural Steel (Contervel(Stats))     2.2,00000     C.Y.     \$525       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2.2,00000     C.Y.     \$225       Structural Steel (Contervel(Stats))     2.2,0000     C.Y.     \$225       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2.3,000     L.F.     \$31,168       Ort-Line Trackwork     1     L.S.     \$270,000     L.F.       Structural Steel (Contervel(Stats))     2.4000     L.B.     \$31,260       Ort-Line Trackwork     5     5,400     L.F. <t< td=""><td></td><td>5, 5 3, 5</td><td></td><td>\$705.00 \$975.000 00 \$975.000 00 \$135.900 00 \$135.900 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$33,000 00 \$33,0000 00 \$30,000 00 \$30,000000000000000000000000000000000</td><td>\$315,840,00 \$975,000,00 \$975,000,00 \$15,500,000 \$15,520,000,00 \$476,100,00 \$476,100,00 \$477,100,00 \$57,200,000 \$57,200,000 \$1,307,000,00 \$1,307,000,00 \$1,307,000,00 \$1,457,000,00 \$1,457,000,00 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,0000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,00000 \$3,456,000,00000 \$3,456,00000000000000000000000000000000000</td></t<>		5, 5 3, 5		\$705.00 \$975.000 00 \$975.000 00 \$135.900 00 \$135.900 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$33,000 00 \$33,0000 00 \$30,000 00 \$30,000000000000000000000000000000000	\$315,840,00 \$975,000,00 \$975,000,00 \$15,500,000 \$15,520,000,00 \$476,100,00 \$476,100,00 \$477,100,00 \$57,200,000 \$57,200,000 \$1,307,000,00 \$1,307,000,00 \$1,307,000,00 \$1,457,000,00 \$1,457,000,00 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,0000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,000,000 \$3,456,00000 \$3,456,000,00000 \$3,456,00000000000000000000000000000000000
Proportiency promises     255     L.F.       Statinamic Axial Load Test     1     E.K.       Statinamic Axial Load Test     1     E.K.       Statinamic Axial Load Test     1     E.K.       Statinamic Axial Load Test     6,700     CY       Structural Steel     6,700     CY     500,750       Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     6,700     CY     500,750       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     CY     5642       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     2,200,000     CY     5642       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     CY     56,70       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     CY     57,700       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     CY     57,146       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     CY     52,400       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     57,146       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     51,46       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     51,46       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     51,46       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     51,750       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     51,46       Structural		\$100 \$1,50 \$1,50		\$200 00 \$975,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$13,000 00 \$1,000 000 \$1,000 000000000000000000000000000000000	555,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$482,400 00 \$475,100 00 \$47,200 00 \$47,200 00 \$57,200 00 \$57,200 00 \$51,320,000 00 \$51,320,000 00 \$1,557,000 00 \$2,556,000 00 \$2,556,000 00 \$3,556,000 00 \$3,556,0000
Statutural Statistical Texture     1     LS     \$70,000       Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     6,700     CX     \$40     500,750       Reinforcing Steal     6,700     CX     \$40     500,750       Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     6,700     CX     \$49       Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     6,700     CX     \$49       Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     56     CX     \$49       Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     56     CX     \$49       Structural Steel (Lth Span)     2,200,000     CY     \$45       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,40000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,40000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,40000     LF     \$3,178       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,40000     LB     \$2,5000       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,40000     LB     \$3,152,000       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,540000     LF     \$3,12000       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,540000     LB     \$3,152,000       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,540000     2,540000     \$3,152,000       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,540000     2,540000       Structural Steel (Counterweights) </td <td></td> <td>ю ю </td> <td></td> <td>\$975,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$72,000 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,040 00 \$1,440 00 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,5000 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,50000 \$5,50000 \$5,500000 \$5,500000 \$5,500000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000000</td> <td>8975,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$482,400.00 \$482,400.00 \$475,100.00 \$57,280,000.00 \$57,280,000.00 \$57,280,000.00 \$57,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.00000 \$1,557,000.00000 \$1,557,000.000000 \$1,557,000.00000 \$1,557,000.0000000000000000000000000000000</td>		ю ю 		\$975,000 00 \$135,000 00 \$72,000 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,040 00 \$1,440 00 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,5000 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,500 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,5000 \$5,50000 \$5,50000 \$5,500000 \$5,500000 \$5,500000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,5000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000 \$5,50000000000	8975,000.00 \$135,000.00 \$482,400.00 \$482,400.00 \$475,100.00 \$57,280,000.00 \$57,280,000.00 \$57,280,000.00 \$57,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.0000 \$1,557,000.00000 \$1,557,000.00000 \$1,557,000.000000 \$1,557,000.00000 \$1,557,000.0000000000000000000000000000000
Structural Scentron     4     5				\$1:35,000,00 \$72,00 \$1,980,000 \$1,100,00 \$1,100,00 \$1,200,00 \$1,000 0 \$1,000 0 \$1,000 0 \$1,000 0 \$1,000 0 \$1,000 0 \$3,500 0 \$5,56 5 \$5,56 5 \$5	\$15,000 00 \$42,400.00 \$15,220,000 00 \$2780,000 00 \$5,280,000 00 \$5,280,000 00 \$1,200,000 00 \$1,520,000 00 \$1,520,000 00 \$1,557,000 00 \$1,557,0
Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     4     0,00     0,10     5     500,00     0,10       Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     5     5     0,70     849,00     18     51,20       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     5     0,70     5     500,00     0,7     554,2       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     5     0,70     5     5,40     5,40       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,200,000     0,7     5,27     5,50     5,7       Structural Steel (Countervelopits)     2,200,000     0,7     5,72     5,50       Structural Steel (Countervelopits)     2,200,000     0,1     8,72,6       Structural Steel (Countervelopits)     2,200,000     1,770,000     1,8     5,72       Structural Steel (Countervelopits)     2,4000     1,8     5,72     5,400       Structural Steel (Countervelopits)     2,5,400     1,8     5,1738,000       Off-Line Trackwork     1,1     1,5     5,1738,000       Structural Steel (Countervelopit     2,4000     1,1     1,5       Off-Line Trackwork     1,1     1,5     5,1738,000       Structural Steel (Countervelopit     2,4000     1,1     1,5       Structural Steel (Countervelopit     2,4000     1,1     1,5 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>\$72.00 \$33,980,000 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,000 00 \$1,000 00 \$1,000 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$33,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$33,000 00 \$35,000 00 \$35,0000 00 \$35,0000 00 \$35,000000000000000000000000000000000000</td> <td>\$42,400.00 \$475,000.00 \$475,000.00 \$57,200.000 \$57,200.00 \$15,200.000 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,357,000.00 \$1,357,000.00 \$3,465,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.000000 \$3,460,000.00000 \$3,460,000.0000000000000000000000000000000</td>				\$72.00 \$33,980,000 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,000 00 \$1,000 00 \$1,000 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$31,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$33,000 00 \$32,000 00 \$33,000 00 \$35,000 00 \$35,0000 00 \$35,0000 00 \$35,000000000000000000000000000000000000	\$42,400.00 \$475,000.00 \$475,000.00 \$57,200.000 \$57,200.00 \$15,200.000 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,357,000.00 \$1,357,000.00 \$3,465,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.00 \$3,460,000.000000 \$3,460,000.00000 \$3,460,000.0000000000000000000000000000000
Reinforcing Steel         Reinforcing Steel           Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)         4,900         CY         \$449.00         CY				\$1,980,000 00 \$1,100 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,200 00 \$1,040 00 \$5,55 \$5,55 \$8,65	515,220,000 00 3476,100 00 55,280,000 00 567,200 00 567,200 00 515,704,000 00 519,340,000 00 51,557,000 00 51,557,0000
Concrete Class A (AE) (Substructure)     ************************************				\$1,06 \$1,100.00 \$1,200.00 \$3,300.00 \$1,040.00 \$4,70 \$4,70 \$5,50 \$5,56 \$5,56 \$5,56	\$476,100.00 \$5,280,000.00 \$67,280,000.00 \$170,4000.00 \$2,704,000.00 \$1,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00 \$3,456,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Concrete Class A (AE) (Slabs)     5     C.Y.     5       Concrete Class A (AE) (Temi Scal)     5     C.Y.     55       Concrete Class A (AE) (Temi Scal)     5     C.Y.     55       Concrete Class A (AE) (Temi Scal)     2200,000     C.Y.     55       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2200,000     LB     52,25       Structural Steel (Curnerweights)     2200,000     LB     52,25       Structural Steel (Curnerweights)     2200,000     LB     52,25       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     25,400     LB     51,76       Off-Line Trackwork     1     25,400     LB     51,79       Demolytinery/Tender's House     1     LS     51,7500       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     51,5700       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     51,527,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     51,728,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     51,728,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     51,728,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     <				\$1,100.00 \$1,200.00 \$3,300.00 \$1,040.00 \$4,70 \$4,70 \$5,55 \$5,56 \$5,56 \$5,56	\$5,280,000.00 \$67,200.00 \$16,500.00 \$10,340,000.00 \$1,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     5     CY     5554       Concrete Class A (AE) (Misc)     2,00000     CY     5554       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,000000     CY     572       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     572       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     52,30       Structural Steel (Towers)     55,400     LB     51,178,000       Off-Line Trackwork     1     LS     54,000     LB       Structural Steel (Towers)     55,400     LB     51,780,000       Off-Line Trackwork     1     LS     51,780,000       Demolitinery/Tender's House     1     LS     51,780,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS </td <td></td> <td>_</td> <td></td> <td>81,200.00 \$1,040.00 \$4.70 \$5.50 \$5.65 \$8.65</td> <td>\$67,200.00 \$16,500.00 \$2,704,000.00 \$10,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00</td>		_		81,200.00 \$1,040.00 \$4.70 \$5.50 \$5.65 \$8.65	\$67,200.00 \$16,500.00 \$2,704,000.00 \$10,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Concrete Class B (AE) (Tremi Seal)     2,600     CY     \$493       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     CY     \$493       Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     CY     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Towers)     7,700,000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     \$2,25       Structural Steel (Existing Truss Mods)     26,000     LB     \$2,25       Off-Line Trackwork     1     LS     \$3,140       Off-Line Trackwork     1     LS     \$3,7300       Demolition of Existing Structure     1     LS     \$3,73000       Machinery     1     LS     \$3,73000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     \$3,526,000       Span Lork Machinery     1     LS     \$3,526,000 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>\$3,040.00 \$1,040.00 \$5,50 \$5,65 \$5,65</td><td><ul> <li>N 9, 50, 00</li> <li>N 9, 200, 00</li> <li>S 10, 340, 000, 00</li> <li>S 1, 320, 000, 00</li> <li>S 1, 320, 000, 00</li> <li>S 1, 557, 000, 00</li> <li>S 3, 456, 000, 00</li> </ul></td></td<>				\$3,040.00 \$1,040.00 \$5,50 \$5,65 \$5,65	<ul> <li>N 9, 50, 00</li> <li>N 9, 200, 00</li> <li>S 10, 340, 000, 00</li> <li>S 1, 320, 000, 00</li> <li>S 1, 320, 000, 00</li> <li>S 1, 557, 000, 00</li> <li>S 3, 456, 000, 00</li> </ul>
Structural Steel (Lift Span)     2,200,000     C Y     2,270       Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)     2,40,000     LB     2,225       Structural Steel (Towers)     37,700,000     LB     2,225       Structural Steel (Towers)     1,700,000     LB     2,225       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     2,5400     LB     3,146       Structural Steel (Counterweights)     25,400     LB     3,148       Off-Liner Tackwork     460     LF     8,572       Demolition of Existing Truss Mods)     25,400     LB     3,178       Off-Liner/Teenders House     1     LS     8,173       Span Drive Machinery     460     LF     8,522,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     8,122,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     8,322,000       Span Balance Blocks     Scrap Metal for Counterweight     50,000 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>51,040,000 \$4,70 \$5,50 \$5,65 \$8,65</td> <td>st./04,000.00 \$10,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$9,605,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00</td>				51,040,000 \$4,70 \$5,50 \$5,65 \$8,65	st./04,000.00 \$10,340,000.00 \$1,320,000.00 \$9,605,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)         240,000         LB         \$2,25           Structural Steel (Towers Misc)         1,700,000         LB         \$2,26           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         1,700,000         LB         \$2,26           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         1,700,000         LB         \$2,26           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         1,700,000         LB         \$2,26           Off-Lina Teaekwork,         1         1         \$3,168           Off-Lina Traekwork,         460         LF         \$5,700           Demolintery/Traeker's House         1         LL         \$3,178,000           Span Drive Machinery         1         LS         \$3,178,000           Span Drive Machinery         1         LS         \$3,27,000		,620,000.00 ,775,000.00 ,440,000.00		\$5.50 \$5.65 \$8.65	\$1,320,000.00 \$9,605,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Structural Steel (Towers Misc)         1,700,000         LB         \$2.36           Structural Steel (Towers Misc)         1,700,000         LB         \$2.25           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         56,000         LB         \$140           Structural Steel (Counterweights)         56,400         LB         \$146           Off-Line Trackwork         400         LF         \$572           Demolitorery/Tender's House         1         LS         \$178,000           Span Drive Machinery         1         LS         \$1798,000           Span Drive Machinery         1         LS         \$1257,000           Span Drive Math for Counterweight         50,000         LB         \$1527,000           Structural & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories         1         LS         \$1257,0		,775,000.00		\$5.65 \$8.65	\$9,605,000.00 \$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Structural Steel (Lowers Misc)         190,000         LB         \$2.25           Structural Steel (Lowers Misc)         54,000         LB         \$1.40           Off-Line Trackwork         54,000         LB         \$1.40           Off-Line Trackwork         54,000         LB         \$1.40           Off-Line Trackwork         1         LS         \$5.72           Demolition of Existing Structure         1         LS         \$572,000           Macchinery/Fenders house         1         LS         \$572,000           Macchinery/Fenders house         1         LS         \$522,000           Span Drive Machinery         1         LS         \$522,000           Span Lork Machinery         1         LS         \$532,000           Uphaul & Commenight         50,000         LS         \$526,000           Span Lork Machinery         1         LS         \$527,000           Structural Concrete in Counterweight         50,000         LS         \$528,000           Structural Concrete in Counterweight         50,000         LS         \$528,000           Structural Concrete in Counterweight         50,000         LS         \$528,000           Structural Concrete in Counterweight         50,000         LS		,440,000.00		\$8.65	\$1,557,000.00 \$3,456,000.00
Structural Steer (Counterweigins)     640.00     LB     51.40       Off-Line Trackwork     6.00     LB     51.40       Demolition of Existing Structure     1     LS     51.780.00       Demolition of Existing Structure     1     LS     51.780.00       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     51.780.00       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     51.327.000       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     51.327.000       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     51.327.000       Uphaul & Sownhaut Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     51.327.000       Uphaul & Sownhaut Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     51.327.000       Structural Occorrete in Counterweight     50.000     LB     51.827.000       Structural Occorrete in Counterweight     50.000     LB     51.827.000       Structural Occorrete in Counterweight     50.000     LS     55.4700       Structural Balance     1     LS     51.827.000       Span Balance     1     LS     51.728.000       Brance Blocks     1     LS     54.7.000       Span Balance     1     LS     51.788.000       Brance Blocks     1     LS     54.7.000       Standy Generator     1     LS     54.7.000					\$3,456,000.00
Ort-Lower access (LANAING) Frush Model     51,68       Ort-Lower access (LANAING) Frush Model     460     LF     \$17,88       Machinery     1     LS     \$1,78,000     \$17,81,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     \$1,78,000     \$1,78,000       Upthaul & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     \$1,78,000       Counterweight     8     \$1     LS     \$255,000       Scrap Metal for Counterweight     630     CY     \$55,000     \$55,000       Strotkurd     630     CY     \$50,000     \$55,000       Strotkurd     1     LS     \$52,000     \$55,000       Strotkurd     630     CY     \$52,000     \$52,000       Strotkurd     630     CY     \$50,000     \$52,000       Strotkurd     630     CY     \$53,000     \$53,000       Strotkurd     630     CY     \$53,000     \$54,7000       Strotkurd     1     LS     \$53,000       Strotkurd     1     LS     \$54,7000		\$1,536,000.00		\$5.40	
Demonstration accuration for Existing Structure     400     L     \$				\$34.00	\$863,600.00
Machinery/Tender's House     1     LS     \$7,20,000       Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     \$1,257,000       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     \$1,257,000       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     \$1,257,000       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     \$1,257,000       Uphaul & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     \$2,326,000       Uphaul & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     \$2,326,000       Structural Concrete in Counterweight     830     CY     \$554       Structural Concrete in Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$0,355       Span Balance     1     LS     \$52,326,000       Balance Blocks     1     LS     \$53,000       Span Balance     1     LS     \$53,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$1,780,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$41,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$40,000       Bridge Strudy Johnes     1     LS     \$40,000				\$800.00	\$368,000.00
Span Drive Machinery     1     LS     \$1,527,000       Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     \$1,527,000       Uphaul & Downhauk Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     \$3,525,000       Uphaul & Downhauk Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     \$3,525,000       Structural Concrete in Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$3,554       Scrap Metal for Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$3,554       Scrap Metal for Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$3,554       Scrap Metal for Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$3,554       Stantow Generation     1     LS     \$3,554       Span Balance Blocks     135,000     LB     \$3,35       Span Balance     1     LS     \$47,200       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$47,200       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$40,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$40,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$40,000	80/0/00/00		**	\$2,000,000.00	\$2,000,000.00
Span Lock Machinery     1     LS     \$382,000       Uphaul & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories     1     LS     \$382,000       Untrainelyth Sheaves, Shaffs & Bearings     1     LS     \$355,000       Counterweight Sheaves, Shaffs & Bearings     1     LS     \$355,000       Structural Concrete in Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$0,000       Structural Concrete in Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$0,000       Balance Blocks     1     LS     \$53,000       Span Balance Blocks     1     LS     \$53,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$1,728,000       Arrial Cables     1     LS     \$1,728,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     LS     \$1,728,000       Bridge Standby Generator     1     LS     \$400,000				\$150,000.00	\$150,000.00
Uphaul & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories     1     Ls.     3255,000       Uphaul & Downhaul Ropes & Accessories     1     Ls.     3255,000       Structuration Correte in Counterweight     630     CY     852,000       Structuration Correte in Counterweight     50,000     LB     80,05       Structuration Correte and Accessories     1     Ls.     82,354,000       Balance Blocks     135,000     LB     80,35       Span Balance     1     Ls.     83,300       Bridge Electrical System     1     Ls.     81,728,000       Arrial Cables     1     Ls.     81,786,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     Ls.     847,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     Ls.     818,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     Ls.     8196,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     Ls.     840,000				\$3,000,000.00	\$3,000,000.00
Counterweight Sheaves, Shafts & Bearings     1     L.S.     \$2,25,000       Structural Concrete in Counterweight     830     C.Y.     \$554       Scrap Metal for Counterweight     50,000     LB     \$30,355       Structural Balance     1,35,000     LB     \$3,355       Span Balance     1,000     LB     \$3,355       Span Balance     1,000     LB     \$3,355       Counterweight Ropes and Accessories     1     L.S.     \$47,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     \$1,735,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     \$1,736,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     \$1,736,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     \$1,94,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     \$1,94,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     \$40,000				00.000,000¢	\$600,000.00
Structural Concrete in Counterweight     630     C.Y.     554       Scrap Metal for Counterweight     65,000     LB     55,000       Balance Balance     135,000     LB     55,300       Span Balance     1     L.S.     55,300       Balance Balance     1     L.S.     55,300       Counterweight Ropes and Accessories     1     L.S.     547,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     547,000       Aerial Cables     1     L.S.     548,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     541,000       Bridge Electrical System     1     L.S.     541,000				\$200,000.00	\$200,000.00
Scrap Metal for Counterweight         50,000         LB         \$0.000         LB         \$0.000         LB         \$0.000         LB         \$0.000         LB         \$0.01         LB         \$0.035         Scalariance         S0.000         LB         \$0.035         Scalariance         S0.000         LB         \$0.035         Scalariance         S0.000         LB         \$0.035         Scalariance         S0.000         S			-	00.000,000,000	\$5,000,000.00
Balance Blocks         135,000         LB         \$0.35           Span Balance         1         LS         \$53,000           Counterweight Ropes and Accessories         1         LS         \$53,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         LS         \$547,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         LS         \$1,728,000           Bridge Stadby Generator         1         LS         \$1,786,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         LS         \$1,96,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         LS         \$1,96,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         LS         \$1,96,000				00 C\$	\$100,000,000
Span Balance         L.S.         \$53,000           Counterweight Ropes and Accessories         1         L.S.         \$547,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         L.S.         \$1728,000           Aerial Cables         1         L.S.         \$196,000           Generator Building         1         L.S.         \$196,000           Bridge Standby Generator         1         L.S.         \$196,000		\$168.750.00		S0 90	\$121 500 00
Counterweight Ropes and Accessories         1         L.S.         s447,000           Bridge Electrical System         1         L.S.         s128,000           Aerial Cables         1         L.S.         s178,000           Generation         1         L.S.         s198,000           Bridge Standby Generator         1         L.S.         s198,000				\$200 000 000 S	\$200 000 000 \$200 000 000
Bridge Electrical System         1         L.S.         \$1728,000           Aerial Cables         1         L.S.         \$1728,000           Generator         1         L.S.         \$186,000           Bridge Standby Generator         1         L.S.         \$400,000		69		\$1.700.000.00	\$1 700 000 00
Arrial Lables         1         L.S.         \$196,000           Generator Building         1         L.S.         \$196,000           Bridge Standby Generator         1         L.S.         \$400,000				\$2,300,000,00	\$2,300,000,00
Bridge Standby Generator 1 L.S. \$18,000 Bridge Standby Generator 1 L.S. \$400,000 Bridge Standby Generator 1 L.S. \$400,0	\$200,000.00	\$200,000.00 \$300,	\$300,000.00 \$300,000.00	\$350,000.00	\$350,000.00
Diruge oraniuty Generator 1 L.S. \$400,000			\$40,000.00 \$40,000.00	\$215,000.00	\$215,000.00
Oneration & Maintenance Manuals & Training		0	07	\$200,000.00	\$200,000.00
Fender Mork				\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00
Site Mork				\$700,000.00	\$700,000.00
-	\$1,000,000.00	\$1,000,000.00 \$425,	\$425,000.00 \$425,000.00	\$2,433,000.00	\$2,433,000.00
*(includes 3% escalation + 6% contingency)					
540,241,826.43	\$69	\$69,945,437.00	\$83,085,475.00		\$89,685,900.00
BOND Performance Bond (if required) 1 L.S. 0.00	0.5333	\$373,000.00	0.4735 \$393.400.00	0 0.5229	\$469 000 00

Figure 3. Bid tabulations from advertisement of proposed replacement structure (CSX Bid, 2006)

### Value Engineering and Proposal

HNTB's approach to the work began with assessment of the contract plans and examination of the bid tabulations to determine the most costly items. HNTB did this by breaking the project up into four major components. These were Substructure, Superstructure, Mechanical & Electrical, and Construction. For each of these components, costliest items were examined to determine how they might be reduced.

### Superstructure and Substructure (See Figure 4))

The cost savings approach to the overall bridge focused on the interrelationship between the superstructure and tower substructure. The major cost of the substructure was two fold.

- The need to utilize cofferdams for all the pier construction.
- The quantities of drilled shafts, concrete and reinforcing steel being utilized for the construction of the piers.

HNTB's proposed solution was to utilize single steel box towers in lieu of the four legged towers thereby eliminating the need for the rear tower legs, tower piers, tower jump spans and the modifications required to the fixed approach steel truss spans. Although the quantity of steel for the box sections is comparable to the four column tower, its foot print is significantly smaller.



Figure 4. Rendering of Conceptual Arrangement of VE Structure (HNTB, 2007)

HNTB also proposed to utilize waterline footings on drilled shafts to avoid the costly cofferdam construction. A portion of the new footings was underwater and thus floating forms were required similar to what has been used on other of HNTB Designs. With the form partially submerged, the form acts as a

tub withstanding the hydrostatic pressure of the water and, once the concrete is poured, to hold the concrete in position while curing.

The replacement of the large deep piers with pier caps allowed significant reduction in the quantities of concrete and reinforcing. This also resulted in less dead load for the drilled shafts to carry. This, in turn, reduced the quantity of the drilled shafts.

#### Lift Span Superstructure

HNTB developed a more economical span length for the superstructure by placing the new footing for Pier 2 outside of the existing Pier 2 and getting the new pier 4A as close to the existing Pier 4 as possible. This could be done because the new drilled shafts are away from the existing piers. By doing this, the span length was able to be reduced from 365 feet to 357 feet. To still allow the new lift span to be supported on the new portion of the footings, the span width had to be increased to approximately 38 feet wide from the original 22 feet wide. This required the floorbeams to be heavier to accommodate the wider span. By utilizing this reduced span length, the truss modification to the existing eastern fixed approach span was no longer required.

#### **Mechanical and Electrical**

Examination of the mechanical and electrical system revealed that the motors to lift the bridge were undersized in terms of the original design, and would be operating 60% over their full load capacity (AREMA, 2000). HNTB developed two alternates to accommodate the system as originally designed. The first alternate was to enlarge the motor to the proper size, but this would result in the need for a complete redesign of the mechanical and electrical systems. The second alternate was to develop a scheme to reduce the operating loads. This was done by changing the bronzed bushed counterweight sheave bearings to roller bearings. By doing so, the frictional load was dramatically reduced and overall operating loads were reduced.

#### Construction

During the bidding phase of the project, the contractors expressed concern with the requirements for minimizing the fouling of the tracks. Strict railroad guidelines exist that any crane or equipment has to be clear of the tracks a certain time before a train is passing. Since this was a main line track, the approximately 20 trains per day expected would result in the crane being stored more than utilized, resulting in a very inefficient and costly use of the cranes. The original tower design required the erection of numerous truss members within the track envelope resulting in costly erection. In contrast, HNTB's proposed single towers, which are located outside the new lift span truss panels, could be partially erected off site and installed in sections, resulting in a more efficient erection procedure and less time with the cranes deployed within or around the track fouling area.

Utilization of the water line footings resulted in multiple advantages from a construction standpoint. First it eliminated all need for cofferdams. These cofferdams were very expensive due the tight regulation on not interrupting rail traffic as well as the very restrictive clearance underneath the existing approach span where the cofferdam had to be installed. The placement of the cap beams outside of the existing piers allows their construction to occur with minimal interference to rail operations. This will expedite their

construction assisting in lowering the unit cost of material installation. The unit price for the concrete would increase slightly to compensate for the necessity of utilizing the more costly form system.

#### **Comparison of Costs**

Once the structure type was developed and major details were worked out for the Value Engineering Alternate, quantities were determined to compare the existing and new designs and establish the cost savings. HNTB developed a spreadsheet that showed the original unit prices, original quantities and the new quantities for the proposed VE Alternate Structure. This provided a side by side comparison of both structures to clearly indicate where the cost savings could be achieved. (See Figure 5)

Items Af	ffected by VE	Quantities					
ltem No.		AS BID		HNTB		Unit Price	Savings
4A	Drilled Shaft (7' dia)	1,952	L.F.	1,808	L.F.	\$1,374.00	\$197,856.00
4B	Drilled Shaft (5' dia)	1,328	L.F.	0	L.F.	\$701.00	\$930,928.00
4C	Drilled Shaft 7' Casing	432	L.F.	400	L.F.	\$1,200.00	\$38,400.00
4D	Drilled Shaft 5' Casing	448	L.F.	0	L.F.	\$1,076.00	\$482,048.00
5A	Structural Excavation	6,700	C.Y.	0	C.Y.	\$149.00	\$998,300.00
5B	Cofferdams	4	EA.	0	EA.	\$2,083,627.00	\$8,334,508.00
6	Reinforcing Steel	449,600	LB	130,700	LB	\$2.10	\$669,690.00
7A	Concrete Class A	4,800	C.Y.	1,307	C.Y.	\$842.00	\$2,941,106.00
	Cost Differential for Floating Forms	0	C.Y.	1,307	C.Y.	\$252.60	-\$330,148.20
7D	Concrete Class B	2,600	C.Y.	0	C.Y.	\$600.00	\$1,560,000.00
8A	Structural Steel (Lift Span)	2,200,000	LB	2,320,000	LB	\$5.63	-\$675,600.00
8B	Structural Steel (Lift Span Misc)	240,000	LB	240,000	LB	\$6.75	\$0.00
8C	Structural Steel (Towers)	1,700,000	LB	1,320,000	LB	\$5.75	\$2,185,000.00
8D	Structural Steel (Towers Misc)	180,000	LB	180,000	LB	\$8.00	\$0.00
8E	Structural Steel (Counterweights)	640,000	LB	640,000	LB	\$2.40	\$0.00
8F	Structural Steel (Existing Truss Mods)	25,400	LB	10,160	LB	\$12.00	\$182,880.00
19A	Structural Concrete in Counterweight	630	C.Y.	660	C.Y.	\$750.00	-\$22,500.00
27	Fender Work	\$500,000	L.S.	\$500,000	L.S.		-\$0
New Item	Existing Pier Rehabilitation	\$0	L.S.	\$250,000	L.S.		-\$250,000.00
						Total Cost Savings	\$17,242,467.80

#### Comparison of Quantities between Bid and VE Recommendations

Figure 5. Potential Cost Savings from VE review (HNTB, 2007)



Figure 6. Rendering of HNTB proposed final design alternate (HNTB, 2009)

### Conclusion

This project emphasizes the need for bridge designers to carefully assess all project constraints when preparing designs. As in this case, such constraints can go beyond the physical characteristics of the site, the configuration and condition of existing structures, the function of the new or modified facility, the availability of labor, materials and equipment, and the usual codes and standards used for design. Other possible constraints can include local or owner-specific standards and rules (particularly with respect to safety on railroads) and the practicality of normally accepted construction techniques in specific applications. The challenge to identify such constraints by investigation early on, and to think creatively to meet them, can help to avoid unanticipated cost overruns and delays. A value engineering analysis can lead to significant cost savings.

### **References and Acknowledgements**

AREMA, 2000, American Railway Engineering and Maintenance-of-Way Association *Manual for Railway Engineering*, Section 6.7.5.5, Motor Torque for Span Operation
CFR 33, 2008, Code of Federal Regulations (USA), 33 CFR 116. (Truman-Hobbs Act, 1940)
CSX Plans, 2006, CSX Transportation Plans for the Modification of Bridge 193 at Mile Post 653.44 Crossing the Mobile River Near Hurricane, AL (February, 2006)
CSX Bid, 2006, CSX Transportation / US Coast Guard
HNTB, 2007, HNTB Corporation, *CSX Bridge 193 Mobile River Value Engineering Report*HNTB, 2009, HNTB Corporation, renderings

HNTB is grateful for the opportunity afforded us to perform this work, and to the following persons for the consideration and cooperation provided during the project:

- Kamal Elnahal, PE, United States Coast Guard
- Rick Garro, PE, Chief Engineer, CSX Transportation
- Bob Walter, PE, Project Manager, HDR Engineering
- Chuck Davis, PE, Chief Engineer, Scott Bridge Company